

**CITY OF ELIZABETH CITY
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, December 12, 2019
4:30 PM**

MEMBERS PRESENT

Rick Boyd - Chairman
Ed Fearing - Vice Chairman
Georgenes Falcon
Blair Jackson
David Luke
Rachel Stallings
Charlene Wade (Absent)

Also present were Kellen Long, Planner; Yvette Chamblee, Secretary to the Commission; and members of the audience.

Chairman Boyd called the meeting to order at approximately 4:30pm with a roll call and stated there was a quorum.

Ms. Stallings made a motion to **APPROVE** the agenda as presented. Ms. Falcon seconded the motion. **ALL IN FAVOR: FALCON, FEARING, JACKSON, LUKE, AND STALLINGS. NONE OPPOSED. MOTION CARRIED.**

Ms. Stallings made a motion to **APPROVE** the Thursday, November 7, 2019 minutes. Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. **ALL IN FAVOR: FALCON, FEARING, JACKSON, LUKE, AND STALLINGS. NONE OPPOSED. MOTION CARRIED.**

Ms. Chamblee, secretary to the Commission, read the **STATEMENT OF DISCLOSURE** as follows:

Elizabeth City Code of Ethics provides that public officials and employees be independent, impartial, and responsible to the public; that government decisions and policy be made in proper channels of the governmental structure; that public office not be used for personal gain; and that the public have confidence in the integrity of its government. In recognition of these goals and in keeping with the ethical standards of conduct for city public officials and its employees; disclosure of interest in legislative action must be stated for public record, as per City of Elizabeth City Code of Ordinances Section 32.04. Any official act or action before the Historic Preservation Commission shall be publicly disclose on the record of the Commission the nature and extent of such interest and the Commissioner shall withdraw from any consideration of the matter if excused by the Commission pursuant to G.S. 160A-75.

Chairman Boyd read the following **STATEMENT FROM THE CHAIRMAN:**

Prior to today's meeting, notification was sent to neighbors living within 100' of the properties in question. Commission members received a copy of each application and were to visit the site. North Carolina law provides that persons have an opportunity to address an application; thus the Commission conducts a public hearing on the application. During the hearing the Commission receives evidence to determine that proposed changes are not incongruous with the special character of the historic district or the historic property. They review this evidence against guidelines listed in the City's ordinance before issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness. Each application is heard the same way. The judicial format of the hearing requires that they be impartial. Any written Staff comments are evidence presented just as any other evidence. If any Commission member has had reason to discuss the specific details of the application; they ask to be excused from hearing the application.

Because of the quasi-judicial format of the hearings, the Commission hears evidence and judges whether the change is not incongruous. The Commission is required by North Carolina law to swear in persons who speak before the Commission and offer evidence.

Ms. Kellen Long, Holly Luke, and Floyd Brickhouse came forth and was sworn.

Application HP 18-19, filed by Holly Luke, for the property located at 601 East Elizabeth Street. The applicant is requesting approval to paint a mural on the east elevation of the structure fronting Pailin's Alley.

Historic Preservation Commissioner David Luke recused himself from hearing case number HP 18-19 due to the fact the applicant, Holly Luke, is his wife.

Ms. Long presented her Staff Analysis report as follows:

The first case before you this afternoon is HP 18-19 filed by Holly Luke for the property located at 601 East Elizabeth Street. The property currently maintains the original Central Business (CB) zoning classification designated at the time the Unified Development Ordinance and official zoning map were adopted by the City of Elizabeth City.

601 East Elizabeth Street is listed on the National Register of Historic Places-Inventory Nomination Form. It was believed to be built in 1970 according to the nomination form. It is described in the nomination form to be a 1-story brick and glass building that was used as an ABC store after construction. There is no individual description for this property on file.

The applicant is requesting approval to paint a 16' x 42' mural on the east elevation of the structure, fronting Pailin's Alley. A rendering of the mural has been added to the staff analysis for reference. The materials that the applicant is wishing to use have also been added to your packet, along with color samples. It is the applicant's wish to paint directly on the un-painted brick.

Your Local Historic District and Landmark Design Guidelines state the following in regards to art in our local historic district:

The remnants of historic signs painted on historic structures throughout downtown have also become a form of public art. As the City continues to grow as an arts community, public art that pays homage to and compliments our history should be encouraged.

GUIDELINES

1-7.1 Artwork shall be of appropriate design and scale for the district.

1-7.2 Wall-mounted art, such as murals, shall be located so as not to obscure character-defining features or details.

1-7.3 Artwork shall be properly cared for and repaired to maintain the appearance of the work.

1-7.4 Methods of stabilization and attachment shall be fully reversible and not cause damage to historic materials.

1-7.5 Artwork which involves painting previously unpainted masonry is not appropriate.

1-7.6 Accessories to the artwork, such as mounting hardware and lighting, shall be discreet and screened from view as much as possible.

Unfortunately, the National Park Service Briefs do not provide any input or direction for murals or public art in general.

Staff is generally of the opinion that the request of the mural is appropriate, however, it is staff's recommendation that the appropriateness of the application of the mural be ruled by the Commission because of the proposal to paint directly on the raw material of the building.

It should be noted for the record that the structure of 601 East Elizabeth Street is not currently a contributing structure to the historic district due to the age of the structure.

Should the Commission deem the request appropriate and issue the Certificate, staff recommends the following as conditions of approval:

- Abrasive cleaning methods shall not be used when prepping the masonry for application; and
- The mural shall be maintained and well-kept at all times.

This concluded Ms. Long's presentation.

Ms. Holly Luke, the applicant, came forth and explained to the Historic Preservation Commission her request to paint a 16' X 42' mural direct on the east elevation of the structure, fronting Pailin's Alley.

Ms. Long stated for the record the proposed mural would not be violating the signage or advertisement portion of the Unified Development Ordinance.

Mr. Fearing made a motion to **APPROVE** HP 18-19 with the following recommendations:

- Abrasive cleaning methods shall not be used when prepping the masonry for application; and
- The mural shall be maintained and well-kept at all times.

Ms. Jackson seconded the motion. **ALL IN FAVOR: FALCON, FEARING, JACKSON, LUKE, AND STALLINGS. NONE OPPOSED. MOTION CARRIED.**

Historic Preservation Commissioner David Luke returned to his seat with the Commissioners.

Application HP 20-19, filed by Floyd Brickhouse with Brickhouse Construction, for the property located at 206 East Church Street. The applicant is requesting approval to remodel the front porch on the south elevation of the structure. This remodel would include several items including, reframing, a change in roofing material, and installation of seamless gutters and downspouts.

Ms. Long presented her Staff Analysis report as follows:

The second case before you this afternoon is HP 20-19 filed by Floyd Brickhouse representing Brickhouse Construction for the property at 206 East Church Street. The property currently maintains the original Central Business (CB) zoning classification designated at the time the Unified Development Ordinance and official zoning map were adopted by the City of Elizabeth City.

206 East Church Street is listed on the National Register of Historic Places-Inventory Nomination Form. It was believed to be built in 1890, according to the nomination form. It is described in the nomination form to be a 2-story frame house. There is no individual description for this property on file.

The applicant is requesting approval to remodel the front porch on the south elevation of the structure. This remodel would include:

- Removal of the worn metal roofing (for the front porch only)
- Removal of the roof sheathing
- Removal of the existing porch frame
- new Framing of Ceiling Structure
- Wrapping exterior of the structure trim with PVC coated trim
- Install new ceiling under the porch with vinyl beaded ceiling
- Install new sheathing on roof
- Install ice and water shield over the entire roof
- Install antique slate GAF Timberline Cool Series roofing shingles
- Install seamless gutter and downspouts around the porch

The local Historic District and Landmark Design Guidelines in your ECHPC binder have two sections that address roofs and metals found within our local Historic District. I have provided the recommendations from both chapters in the staff analysis, as well as a short brief from the National Park Service Technical Preservation Services to support the local design guidelines.

Due to the current condition of the metal roof on the front porch and the elevation of porch roof, staff is of the general opinion that the proposal to replace the metal roof with antique slate roofing shingles will not have a negative impact on the historic character of the structure or district. In utilizing the steps identified in the National Park Services Technical Preservation Brief 4, titled alternative methods of roofing in historic districts. if the roof is flat or not visible from any elevation of the building, and if there are advantages to substituting a modern built –up composition roof for what might have been a flat metal roof, then it may make better economic and construction sense to use a modern roofing method.

If the Commission finds the Applicant’s proposal acceptable and the Certificate of Appropriateness is approved, Staff recommends the following as a condition of the approval:

- All necessary building permits shall be secured prior to commencing work;
- Care shall be taken to minimize the loss of historic material;

This concluded Ms. Long's presentation.

Mr. Floyd Brickhouse, the applicant, came forth and explained to the Historic Preservation Commission his request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior modifications to a front porch.

Ms. Stallings made a motion to **APPROVE** HP 20-19 with the following recommendations:

All necessary building permits shall be secured prior to commencing work;
Care shall be taken to minimize the loss of historic material;

Ms. Falcon seconded the motion. **ALL IN FAVOR: FALCON, FEARING, JACKSON, LUKE, AND STALLINGS. NONE OPPOSED. MOTION CARRIED.**

STAFF REPORT

Ms. Long discussed the following with the Historic Preservation Commission:

- Currently working on a certified local government report survey due December 20, 2019;
- Working on a 2019 Historic Preservation Commission report to show what the Historic Preservation Commission has accomplished or approved throughout the year; and
- Having a 30-minute Historic Preservation Commission meeting in January 2020.

OLD BUSINESS

- The house across from Muddy's will be demolished sometime this year.

NEW BUSINESS

- The Historic Preservation Commission discussed a new meeting day of the week for each regular meeting during the year 2020. The Historic Preservation Commission will be meeting on the second Wednesday of each month at 4:30 PM during the year 2020.

Mr. Fearing made a motion to **ADJOURN** the Thursday, December 12, 2019 Historic Preservation Commission meeting. Ms. Stallings seconded the motion. **ALL IN FAVOR: FALCON, FEARING, JACKSON, LUKE, AND STALLINGS. NONE OPPOSED. MOTION CARRIED.**

The Thursday, December 12, 2019 Historic Preservation Commission meeting adjourned at 4:58 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Yvette M. Chamblee
Secretary to the Historic Preservation Commission